

October 5, 2016

Thomas J. Nasca, M.D., M.A.C.P.
Chief Executive Officer
Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education
515 North State Street, Suite 2000
Chicago, IL 60654

**Re: The Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education's (ACGME's)
Common Program Requirements for Resident Duty Hours in the Learning and
Working Environment**

Dear Dr. Nasca:

The undersigned patient safety groups and individual patient safety advocates from across the country are writing to express our agreement with Public Citizen's position, outlined in its September 13 letter to you, that the ACGME should reject calls to do away with the cap of 16 consecutive hours on the work shifts of first-year residents (interns).

The recently released results of a new national public opinion poll commissioned by Public Citizen and conducted by Lake Research Partners indicate that the vast majority (86 percent) of the American public is opposed to lifting this 16-hour cap for interns.¹ Indeed, the poll showed that the public favors, by a similarly overwhelming majority (80 percent), the implementation of 16-hour maximum shift durations for *all* residents. The results were entirely bipartisan and consistent with those of a similar poll published in 2010.²

As documented by Public Citizen in its report, the public's commonsense approach also is fully justified by the evidence on the risks of long work shifts without sleep on the safety of both residents themselves and their patients. A substantial body of literature shows that sleep deprivation due to excessively long work shifts increases the risk of motor vehicle accidents,^{3,4,5} depression,^{6,7,8} and needle-stick and other injuries that can expose residents to bloodborne pathogens.^{9,10} Depriving medical residents of sleep also exposes their patients to an increased risk of medical errors,¹¹ which can lead to patient injury and death.

As you know, in 2009, the Institute of Medicine (IOM) issued a report calling for a significant reduction in the hours that interns and residents were required to work.¹² The IOM determined that the evidence linking sleep deprivation with preventable medical errors and illness and injury to residents was sufficient to warrant a reduction in work hours. For this reason, the IOM recommended in its report that *no* residents be allowed to work shifts of longer than 16 consecutive hours.

In response to the IOM's findings and considerable public pressure, the ACGME tightened work-hour restrictions in 2011. Unfortunately, the ACGME implemented the 16-hour shift limit only for interns, allowing other residents to work 28-hour shifts. Still, the 2011 rules were an improvement over the 30-hour shifts allowed for all residents since 2003.¹³

Those attacking the ACGME's current resident work-hour restrictions argue that the limits increase medical errors by increasing the frequency of patient handoffs between medical residents. However, as documented by Public Citizen in its report accompanying the results of the poll, there is no valid evidence from well-designed studies to support these assertions. In fact, the most rigorous trial to date of the effects of different work shift lengths found that reducing first-year residents' shifts to 16 hours or less actually *reduced* the frequency of serious medical errors despite an increase in the frequency of patient handoffs.¹⁴ It should be remembered that the ACGME instituted the 16-hour limit for interns because of its own conclusion that interns **“make more errors when working longer consecutive hours.”**¹⁵

Now is not the time to backtrack and force residents to work longer hours. The ACGME instead should strengthen patient and medical resident safety by, among other measures, expanding the current 16-hour cap on work shifts to all residents. As revealed in the Public Citizen/Lake Research Partners poll, 80 percent of Americans support such action.

To address concerns about problems related to patient handoffs, the ACGME should mandate new standards for ensuring that residents are trained on how to implement handoffs in a consistent, standardized, and effective fashion, and require that attending physicians supervise and confirm the adequacy of such handoffs. In its report, Public Citizen summarizes studies published since 2011 that demonstrate the benefits already achieved by standardized handoffs.

We sincerely hope that the ACGME will listen to the American public and reject any calls to remove the 16-consecutive-hour limit for interns. We further urge the ACGME to move to apply this 16-hour cap to all residents, consistent with the IOM's 2009 recommendations and with the opinion of the vast majority of Americans.

Sincerely,

Suzan Shinazy
Founder, Medical Error Transparency Plan

Ilene Corina
President
PULSE Center for Patient Safety Education & Advocacy (Formerly PULSE of NY)

David Swankin, Esq.
President and CEO
Citizen Advocacy Center

Jeanine Thomas
President
MRSA Survivors Network

Karuna Jaggar
Executive Director
Breast Cancer Action

Pat Mastors
Executive Director
Patients' View Institute

Elizabeth Wright
C.U.A.C.K.
Newz, CA

Cathy Marrone
Show Me Your Stethoscope
PA

Jayne Hobbs, RN
Grand Forks, NC

Melissa Brown, RN
Pensacola, FL

Emily Paterson
Mathews, NC

Sheila Gluesing, LISW
Delmar, IA

Deena Sowa McCollum, RN
San Antonio, TX

Robert E. Oshel, PhD
Silver Spring, MD

Danny Long
Chapel Hill, NC

Pam Walter, RN, CCRN
Deland, FL

Kathy Day, RN
Patient Safety Advocate
Bangor, ME

Marie C. Taylor, RN-BSN
Oxford, OH

Jean Kestner
Pittsburg, PA

Jeanette Hand, RN
New Market, MD

Pam Barcomb
Charleston, SC

Reezena Malaska
Brecksville, OH

Sabrina Flores
San Antonio, TX

Beth Ann Algie, RN
Tallahassee, FL

Shannon Lynn Sullivan
Chicago, IL

Donna Parsons
Huntsville, AL

Farrowine Marsh
Philadelphia, PA

Michael Malley
Philadelphia, PA

Ellen Smith
Denver, CO

Gayton Judy

Missy Grange
Orem UT

Rebecca Martins
Warren, Maine

Joelene Ryan
Franklinville, NJ

Jackie Valdez
San Antonio, TX

¹ Public Citizen and Lake Research Partners. *Bipartisan Consensus: The Public Wants Well-Rested Medical Residents to Help Ensure Safe Patient Care*. September 13, 2016. <http://www.citizen.org/hrg2335>.

-
- ² Blum AB, Raiszadeh F, Shea S, et al. US public opinion regarding proposed limits on resident physician work hours. *BMC Med.* 2010 Jun 1;8:33. doi: 10.1186/1741-7015-8-33.
- ³ Barger LK, Cade BE, Ayas NT, et al. Extended work shifts and the risk of motor vehicle crashes among interns. *N Engl J Med.* 2005;352(2):125-134.
- ⁴ Marcus CL, Loughlin GM. Effect of sleep deprivation on driving safety in housestaff. *Sleep.* 1996;19(10):763-766.
- ⁵ Ware JC, Risser MR, Manser T, Karlson KH. Medical resident driving simulator performance following a night on call. *Behav Sleep Med.* 2006;4(1):1-12.
- ⁶ Sen S, Kranzler HR, Krystal JH, et al. A prospective cohort study investigating factors associated with depression during medical internship. *Arch Gen Psychiatry.* 2010;67(6):557-565.
- ⁷ Berkoff K, Rusin W. Pediatric house staff's psychological response to call duty. *J Dev Behav Pediatr.* 1991;12(1):6-10.
- ⁸ Gottlieb DJ, Peterson CA, Parenti CM, Lofgren RP. Effects of a night float system on housestaff neuropsychologic function. *J Gen Intern Med.* 1993;8(3):146-148.
- ⁹ Parks DK, Yetman RJ, McNeese MC, et al. Day-night pattern in accidental exposures to blood-borne pathogens among medical students and residents. *Chronobiol Int.* 2000;17(1):61-70.
- ¹⁰ Ayas NT, Barger LK, Cade BE, et al. Extended work duration and the risk of self-reported percutaneous injuries in interns. *JAMA.* 2006;296(9):1055-1062.
- ¹¹ Landrigan CP, Rothschild CM, Cronin JW, et al. Effect of reducing interns' work hours on serious medical errors in intensive care units. *N Engl J Med.* 2004;351(18): 1838-1848.
- ¹² IOM (Institute of Medicine). *Resident Duty Hours: Enhancing Sleep, Supervision, and Safety.* 2009. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. <http://www.nap.edu/catalog/12508/resident-duty-hours-enhancing-sleep-supervision-and-safety>.
- ¹³ Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education (ACGME). The ACGME's Approach to Limit Resident Duty Hours 12 Months After Implementation: A Summary of Achievements. http://www.acgme.org/portals/0/pfassets/publicationspapers/dh_dutyhoursummary2003-04.pdf.
- ¹⁴ Landrigan CP, Rothschild CM, Cronin JW, et al. Effect of reducing interns' work hours on serious medical errors in intensive care units. *N Engl J Med.* 2004;351(18): 1838-1848.
- ¹⁵ Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education. The ACGME 2011 Duty Hour Standards: Enhancing Quality of Care, Supervision, and Resident Professional Development. 2011. <https://www.acgme.org/acgmeweb/Portals/0/PDFs/jgme-monograph%5B1%5D.pdf>.