



[www.citizen.org](http://www.citizen.org)

# **Outside Job**

**Winning Candidate Enjoyed Advantage in  
Unregulated Third-Party Spending in 58 of 74  
Party-Shifting Contests**

**November 3, 2010**

## **Acknowledgments**

This report was written by Taylor Lincoln, research director of Public Citizen's Congress Watch division.

## **About Public Citizen**

Public Citizen is a national non-profit organization with more than 160,000 members and supporters. We represent consumer interests through lobbying, litigation, administrative advocacy, research, and public education on a broad range of issues including consumer rights in the marketplace, product safety, financial regulation, safe and affordable health care, campaign finance reform and government ethics, fair trade, climate change, and corporate and government accountability.



Public Citizen's Congress Watch  
215 Pennsylvania Ave. S.E.  
Washington, D.C. 20003  
P: 202-546-4996  
F: 202-547-7392  
<http://www.citizen.org>

© 2010 Public Citizen. All rights reserved.

## Outside Job

**O**f 74 contests in which power changed hands in Tuesday's congressional elections, independent groups engaging in a spree of secretive, corporate- and wealthy-individual-funded electioneering in the wake of *Citizens United v. Federal Election Commission* spent predominately on behalf of the winning candidate in 58 contests, according to Public Citizen's initial analysis.<sup>1</sup> Just 14 of the losing candidates received more help than their opponents from independent groups.

Contests studied include only those in which winners were projected by CNN as of 7:30 a.m. EDT on November 3. It does not include 11 contests, including Senate races in Colorado and Washington, that were too close to call as of Wednesday morning.

Winning candidates in elections in which power changed hands were aided by average spending of \$764,326 by independent groups, while losing candidates were aided by average spending of \$273,268, a ratio of nearly 2.8 to 1. The analysis deemed outside spending as aiding candidates if it either praised them or criticized their opponents. It does not include outside spending for primaries.

The Republican winners in the Pennsylvania and Illinois Senate races received by far the

greatest advantage over their opponents in outside spending. In Illinois, Rep. Mark Kirk (R) benefited from nearly \$8 million in spending over opponent Alexander Giannoulias, chiefly due to \$5.6 million in anti-Giannoulias spending by Karl Rove's American Crossroads and Crossroads GPS entities, and to \$1.7 million in anti-Giannoulias spending by the U.S. Chamber of Commerce. In total, Kirk enjoyed an advantage in outside spending of greater than 11 to 1.

In Pennsylvania's Senate contest, victorious former Rep. Pat Toomey (R) enjoyed an advantage of nearly \$5.3 million—a ratio of nearly 4 to 1—over Rep. Joe Sestak (D). Toomey was aided by \$2.5 million in anti-Sestak spending by the Club for Growth Action Fund, an independent expenditure committee of the organization of which Toomey previously served as president. Also spending more than \$1 million against Sestak were the U.S. Chamber of Commerce (\$1.7 million) and the Republican Jewish Coalition (\$1.1 million).

Of the 74 elections in which party control shifted, Republicans displaced Democrats in 71. The races include 68 House contests and six Senate matchups.

In the three contests in which Democrats defeated incumbent Republicans, the advantage in outside spending was split. In Hawaii's first congressional district, Colleen Hanabusa (D) enjoyed a \$252,045 to \$179,727 advantage over Rep. Charles Djou (R). In Louisiana's second district, Rep. Cedric L. Richmond (D) overcame a \$92,843 to \$18,978 disadvantage in outside groups' spending to defeat Rep. Joseph Cao (R). The Delaware at-large contest, in which Democrat John Carney beat Republican Glen Urquhart, saw only modest outside spending.

---

<sup>1</sup> The analysis includes groups that either accepted contributions in excess of \$5,000, the previous limit for federal political action committees (PACs), or did not disclose their contributions. It does not include spending PACs that did not accept contributions of more than \$5,000 or by party committees. The analysis is based on reports of independent expenditures and electioneering communications to the Federal Election Commission. Independent expenditures expressly advocate for a candidate; electioneering communications mention a candidate but stop short of expressly urging the audience to vote a certain way. This study used *The Washington Post's* determinations on which candidate electioneering communications benefited. This analysis includes reports published by the FEC through October 31.

**Spending By Outside Groups Accepting Unlimited Contributions or Not Disclosing the Source of Their Money in 2010 Senate Elections Resulting in a Partisan Change of Power**

State	Incumb. Party	Winner	Winner Aid from Groups	Loser	Loser Aid from Groups	Winner Advantage or Disad.
IL	D	Mark Kirk (R)	\$8,736,439	Alexander Giannoulas (D)	\$786,880	\$7,949,559
PA	D	Pat Toomey (R)	\$7,121,759	Joseph A. Sestak (D)	\$1,859,345	\$5,262,414
WI	D	Ronald Harold Johnson (R)	\$2,157,477	Russ Feingold (D)	\$40,830	\$2,116,647
AR	D	John Boozman (R)	\$750,530	Blanche Lincoln (D)	\$0	\$750,530
IN	D	Daniel R. Coats (R)	\$274,987	Brad Ellsworth (D)	\$12	\$274,975
ND	D	John Hoeven (R)	\$0	Tracy Potter (D)	\$0	\$0
--	--	<b>Average</b>	\$3,173,532		\$447,845	\$2,725,688

**Spending By Outside Groups Accepting Unlimited Contributions or Not Disclosing the Source of Their Money in 2010 House Elections Resulting in a Partisan Change of Power**

State - District	Incumb. Party	Winner	Winner Aid from Groups	Loser	Loser Aid from Groups	Winner Advantage or Disad.
SC - 5	D	John Michael 'Mick' Mulvaney (R)	\$1,343,965	John M. Spratt Jr (D)	\$6,768	\$1,337,197
SD - 1	D	Kristi Lynn Noem (R)	\$1,323,106	Stephanie Herseth Sandlin (D)	\$29,849	\$1,293,257
FL - 8	D	Daniel Webster (R)	\$1,222,126	Alan Grayson (D)	\$2,181	\$1,219,945
PA - 7	D	Patrick L. Meehan (R)	\$1,266,382	Bryan Lentz (D)	\$71,333	\$1,195,049
PA - 10	D	Tom Marino (R)	\$988,218	Chris Carney (D)	\$17,181	\$971,037
TN - 4	D	Scott Eugene Desjarlais (R)	\$951,445	Lincoln Davis (D)	\$0	\$951,445
NY - 24	D	Richard L Hanna (R)	\$949,903	Michael Arcuri (D)	\$0	\$949,903
NH - 1	D	Frank Guinta (R)	\$1,064,727	Carol Shea-Porter (D)	\$129,597	\$935,130
WV - 1	D	David B. McKinley (R)	\$931,700	Mike Oliverio (D)	\$0	\$931,700
NV - 3	D	Joe Heck (R)	\$2,237,270	Dina Titus (D)	\$1,347,920	\$889,350

State - District	Incumb. Party	Winner	Winner Aid from Groups	Loser	Loser Aid from Groups	Winner Advantage or Disad.
VA - 9	D	Morgan Griffith (R)	\$953,180	Rick Boucher (D)	\$78,149	\$875,031
NH - 2	D	Charles Bass (R)	\$1,470,539	Ann McLane Kuster (D)	\$697,168	\$773,371
NY - 20	D	Chris Gibson (R)	\$950,877	Scott Murphy (D)	\$178,886	\$771,991
WA - 3	D	Jaime Herrera (R)	\$713,459	Dennis Heck (D)	\$2,320	\$711,139
PA - 11	D	Louis J. Barletta (R)	\$683,351	Paul E. Kanjorski (D)	\$0	\$683,351
PA - 3	D	Mike Kelly (R)	\$680,191	Kathleen Dahlkemper (D)	\$16,916	\$663,275
TX - 17	D	William Flores (R)	\$486,721	Chet Edwards (D)	\$0	\$486,721
AZ - 1	D	Paul Gosar (R)	\$513,638	Ann Kirkpatrick (D)	\$27,340	\$486,298
IN - 9	D	Todd Young (R)	\$554,317	Baron Hill (D)	\$71,656	\$482,661
TN - 8	D	Steve Fincher (R)	\$482,309	Roy Herron (D)	\$0	\$482,309
OH - 18	D	Bob Gibbs (R)	\$469,717	Zachary T. Space (D)	\$0	\$469,717
NC - 2	D	Renee Ellmers (R)	\$409,526	Bob Etheridge (D)	\$0	\$409,526
OH - 16	D	James B. Renacci (R)	\$1,563,971	John A. Boccieri (D)	\$1,155,394	\$408,577
IL - 11	D	Adam Kinzinger (R)	\$459,955	Deborah Halvorson (D)	\$55,765	\$404,190
MS - 1	D	Alan Nunnelee (R)	\$464,513	Travis W. Childers (D)	\$68,604	\$395,909
FL - 22	D	Allen B. West (R)	\$505,538	Ron Klein (D)	\$131,014	\$374,524
IN - 8	D	Larry D. Bucshon (R)	\$371,928	Trent Van Haften (D)	\$0	\$371,928
MI - 1	D	Daniel J. Benishek (R)	\$413,643	Gary J. McDowell (D)	\$58,465	\$355,178
GA - 8	D	Austin Scott (R)	\$548,085	Jim Marshall (D)	\$200,300	\$347,785
NJ - 3	D	Jon Runyan (R)	\$338,137	John H. Adler (D)	\$3,560	\$334,577
AR - 1	D	Rick Crawford (R)	\$315,867	Chad Causey (D)	\$5,600	\$310,267
AL - 2	D	Martha Roby (R)	\$477,648	Bobby Bright (D)	\$171,589	\$306,059
FL - 24	D	Sandy Adams (R)	\$302,567	Suzanne Kosmas (D)	\$2,181	\$300,386
ND - 1	D	Rick Berg (R)	\$569,693	Earl Pomeroy (D)	\$270,977	\$298,716

State - District	Incumb. Party	Winner	Winner Aid from Groups	Loser	Loser Aid from Groups	Winner Advantage or Disad.
OH - 15	D	Steve Stivers (R)	\$303,485	Mary Jo Kilroy (D)	\$19,328	\$284,157
NY - 19	D	Nan Hayworth (R)	\$582,808	John Hall (D)	\$319,365	\$263,443
OH - 6	D	Bill Johnson (R)	\$254,897	Charlie Wilson (D)	\$0	\$254,897
FL - 2	D	Steve Southerland (R)	\$839,870	Allen Boyd (D)	\$587,045	\$252,825
MN - 8	D	Chip Cravaack (R)	\$212,556	James L. Oberstar (D)	\$0	\$212,556
OH - 1	D	Steve Chabot (R)	\$217,140	Steve Driehaus (D)	\$24,333	\$192,807
KS - 3	D	Kevin W. Yoder (R)	\$177,622	Stephene Ann Moore (D)	\$0	\$177,622
TX - 27	D	Randolph Blake Far-enthold (R)	\$160,355	Solomon P. Ortiz (D)	\$0	\$160,355
IL - 14	D	Randy Hultgren (R)	\$349,332	Bill Foster (D)	\$207,066	\$142,266
VA - 2	D	Scott Rigell (R)	\$117,457	Glenn Nye (D)	\$0	\$117,457
HI - 1	R	Colleen Hanabusa (D)	\$252,045	Charles Djou (R)	\$179,727	\$72,318
MO - 4	D	Vicky Hartzler (R)	\$125,724	Ike Skelton (D)	\$73,765	\$51,959
PA - 8	D	Michael G. Fitzpatrick (R)	\$282,547	Patrick J. Murphy (D)	\$255,880	\$26,667
MD - 1	D	Andy Harris (R)	\$547,962	Frank M. Kratovil Jr (D)	\$522,649	\$25,313
NY - 13	D	Michael Grimm (R)	\$8,305	Michael E. McMahon (D)	\$0	\$8,305
DE - 1	R	John Carney (D)	\$3,795	Glen Urquhart (R)	\$0	\$3,795
AR - 2	D	Tim Griffin (R)	\$37,274	Joyce Elliott (D)	\$34,292	\$2,982
TN - 6	D	Diane Lynn Black (R)	\$1,830	Brett Carter (D)	\$0	\$1,830
NY - 29	D	Tom Reed (R)	\$1,741	Matthew Zeller (D)	\$0	\$1,741
LA - 3	D	Jeffrey M. Landry (R)	\$1,535	Ravi Sangisetty (D)	\$0	\$1,535
TN - 3	D	Charles J. Fleischmann (R)	\$0	John Wolfe (D)	\$0	\$0
IL - 17	D	Bobby Schilling (R)	\$570,335	Phil Hare (D)	\$573,286	(\$2,951)
ID - 1	D	Raul Labrador (R)	\$87,598	Walt Minnick (D)	\$110,117	(\$22,519)
MS - 4	D	Steven Palazzo (R)	\$0	Gene Taylor (D)	\$55,972	(\$55,972)

State - District	Incumb. Party	Winner	Winner Aid from Groups	Loser	Loser Aid from Groups	Winner Advantage or Disad.
LA - 2	R	Cedric L. Richmond (D)	\$18,978	Joseph Cao (R)	\$92,843	(\$73,865)
TX - 23	D	Francisco Canseco (R)	\$417,164	Ciro D. Rodriguez (D)	\$516,340	(\$99,176)
WI - 7	D	Sean P. Duffy (R)	\$694,755	Julie Lassa (D)	\$798,269	(\$103,514)
CO - 3	D	Scott Tipton (R)	\$680,372	John Salazar (D)	\$908,704	(\$228,332)
AZ - 5	D	David Schweikert (R)	\$519,587	Harry E. Mitchell (D)	\$937,037	(\$417,450)
CO - 4	D	Cory Gardner (R)	\$253,567	Betsy Markey (D)	\$762,162	(\$508,595)
WI - 8	D	Reid Ribble (R)	\$565,821	Steve Kagen (D)	\$1,133,979	(\$568,158)
NM - 2	D	Steve Pearce (R)	\$461,452	Harry Teague (D)	\$1,041,486	(\$580,034)
MI - 7	D	Tim Walberg (R)	\$1,059,004	Mark Schauer (D)	\$1,936,102	(\$877,098)
VA - 5	D	Robert Hurt (R)	\$737,592	Tom Perriello (D)	\$1,640,525	(\$902,933)
--	--	<b>Average</b>	<b>\$551,749</b>	--	<b>\$257,864</b>	<b>\$293,884</b>